

Understanding

CRIMINAL LAW

SIXTH EDITION



Joshua Dressler

 LexisNexis®

**UNDERSTANDING
CRIMINAL LAW**

SIXTH EDITION

LexisNexis Law School Publishing Advisory Board

William Araiza

Professor of Law

Brooklyn Law School

Ruth Colker

Distinguished University Professor & Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law

Ohio State University Moritz College of Law

Olympia Duhart

Associate Professor of Law

Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad Law School

Samuel Estreicher

Dwight D. Opperman Professor of Law

Director, Center for Labor and Employment Law

NYU School of Law

David Gamage

Assistant Professor of Law

UC Berkeley School of Law

Joan Heminway

College of Law Distinguished Professor of Law

University of Tennessee College of Law

Edward Imwinkelried

Edward L. Barrett, Jr. Professor of Law

UC Davis School of Law

Paul Marcus

Haynes Professor of Law

William and Mary Law School

Melissa Weresh

Director of Legal Writing and Professor of Law

Drake University Law School

UNDERSTANDING CRIMINAL LAW

SIXTH EDITION

Joshua Dressler

Frank R. Strong Chair in Law

Michael E. Moritz College of Law

The Ohio State University



ISBN: 978-0-7698-4893-8 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-4224-8629-0 (eBook)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Dressler, Joshua.

Understanding criminal law / Joshua Dressler. -- 6th ed.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-7698-4893-8

1. Criminal law--United States. I. Title.

KF9219.D74 2012

345.73--dc23

201200779

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal

accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc. used under license. Matthew Bender and the Matthew Bender Flame Design are registered trademarks of Matthew Bender Properties Inc.

Copyright © 2012 Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., a member of LexisNexis. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis or Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Massachusetts 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

NOTE TO USERS

To ensure that you are using the latest materials available in this area, please be sure to periodically check the LexisNexis Law School web site for downloadable updates and supplements at www.lexisnexis.com/lawschool.

TERMS OF USE

Your use of this electronic publication (“eBook”) from LexisNexis, a division of Reed Elsevier Inc., Massachusetts corporation, is subject to the following terms and conditions. This eBook is for your personal use only. All access to and use of this eBook is subject to U.S. and international copyright law. All intellectual property rights are reserved to the copyright holder. Redistribution or duplication of this eBook to any other electronic media or a third party is strictly prohibited unless the original eBook is deleted, purged or otherwise destroyed in its entirety. Under no circumstances may you redistribute this eBook commercially or post this eBook on an intranet, internet or SharePoint site. Any transfer of this eBook shall be to an individual person only and will subject the transferee to the terms and conditions. Finally, use of this eBook is further subject to the terms and conditions of use which were accepted at the time you completed your purchase of this eBook from the Bookstore.

Hyperlink Key

In order to distinguish between the links to other sections within LexisNexis™ eBooks and external links to the Internet, we have added color coding to the links.

Following is a color key for the links:

Blue: Links inside the eBook

**To Dottie, David, Lucy Belle, and Maya Shoshana:
Thank you.**

PREFACE TO THE SIXTH EDITION

This text is primarily designed for use by law students enrolled in a course in Criminal Law. It also serves nicely in undergraduate courses covering substantive criminal law. As well, based on comments I have received from practicing attorneys, judges, and scholars (and citations to this text in judicial opinions and scholarly works), this text should be helpful to *anyone* looking for a survey of American criminal law substance and theory. The text considers common law doctrine, statutory reform (with particular emphasis on the Model Penal Code), and constitutional law affecting the substantive criminal law.

I am gratified by the extremely favorable response *Understanding Criminal Law* has received over the years. Therefore, I have avoided the temptation to unnecessarily tinker. Each chapter has been updated from the last edition to ensure that the law described here is as timely as possible. As before, I have included citations to new scholarship in the field in the hope that users will look to some of the sources for additional insights into the various topics. I believe each chapter has been improved overall.

Gender policy of the text. For most of Anglo-American legal history men monopolized the critical roles in the system of criminal justice. With only a few exceptions, lawyers, judges, legislators, jurors, and criminals were men. The only place for a woman in the system was as a crime victim. Such inequality, of course, is changing. As an author of a book that will be read and used by readers of both sexes I wanted to make sure that the text recognized the increasing importance of women in the law. Therefore, when discussing hypothetical defendants and victims, and when writing in general terms about other parties in the legal system — e.g., lawyers, judges, and legislators — I have balanced the account between male and female parties. In odd-numbered chapters the parties are female; in the even-numbered chapters males get equal time. I diverge from this approach only when the gender policy would distort history (e.g., there were no female property-holders in 16th century England) or prove inaccurate as a principle of law, or confuse the reader. Although I received criticism of this style with the first edition, I am gratified that this approach is no longer viewed as unusual.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A book of this length is not possible without help from many people. I wrote the first edition while I was on the faculty at Wayne State University. My colleague there, LeRoy Lamborn, read the first, and often the second, draft of every chapter of the first edition. He provided remarkably helpful editorial and substantive suggestions and encouragement.

Many readers have assisted me over the years in improving the text. I have been blessed with many e-mail messages, letters (remember those?), and telephone calls from professors (here and in Europe, Australia, and New Zealand!), judges, practitioners, and law students, all providing advice, corrections, and citations to lesser-known sources of knowledge. I thank all of you.

Joshua Dressler
January, 2012
Columbus, Ohio

FREQUENTLY CITED SOURCE

This text frequently cites to the Model Penal Code Commentaries, found in two volumes:

American Law Institute, Model Penal Code and Commentaries (Official Draft and Revised Comments) (Part I: General Provisions) (1985); and

American Law Institute, Model Penal Code and Commentaries (Official Draft and Revised Comment) (Part II: Definition of Specific Crimes) (1980).

* * *

These sources are cited in footnotes of this text by use of the shorthand "American Law Institute."

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1 CRIMINAL LAW: AN OVERVIEW

§ 1.01 NATURE OF “CRIMINAL LAW”

[A] Crimes

[1] Comparison to Civil Wrongs

[2] Classification of Crimes

[B] Principles of Criminal Responsibility

§ 1.02 PROVING GUILT AT THE TRIAL

[A] Right to Trial by Jury

[1] In General

[2] Scope of the Right

[B] Burden of Proof

[C] Jury Nullification

[1] The Issue

[2] The Debate

[3] The Law

[4] Race-Based Nullification

Chapter 2 PRINCIPLES OF CRIMINAL PUNISHMENT

§ 2.01 “PUNISHMENT” AND CRIMINAL LAW THEORY

§ 2.02 “PUNISHMENT”: DEFINED

[A] In General

[B] Constitutional Law Analysis

§ 2.03 THEORIES OF PUNISHMENT

[\[A\] Utilitarianism](#)

[\[1\] Basic Principles](#)

[\[2\] Forms of Utilitarianism](#)

[\[B\] Retributivism](#)

[\[1\] Basic Principles](#)

[\[2\] Forms of Retributivism](#)

[\[C\] Denunciation \(Expressive Theory\)](#)

[§ 2.04 THE DEBATE BETWEEN THE COMPETING THEORIES](#)

[\[A\] Criticisms of Utilitarianism](#)

[\[1\] Deterrence](#)

[\[2\] Rehabilitation](#)

[\[B\] Criticisms of Retributivism](#)

[§ 2.05 MIXED THEORIES OF PUNISHMENT](#)

[§ 2.06 SENTENCING](#)

[xii/xiii]

[Chapter 3 SOURCES OF THE CRIMINAL LAW](#)

[§ 3.01 ORIGINS OF THE CRIMINAL LAW](#)

[\[A\] Common Law](#)

[\[B\] Criminal Statutes](#)

[§ 3.02 MODERN ROLE OF THE COMMON LAW](#)

[\[A\] “Reception” Statutes](#)

[\[B\] Statutory Interpretation](#)

[§ 3.03 MODEL PENAL CODE](#)

Chapter 4 CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITS ON THE CRIMINAL LAW

§ 4.01 THE CONSTITUTION: OVERVIEW

§ 4.02 RELEVANT CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS

[A] Bill of Rights

[B] Fourteenth Amendment

§ 4.03 POLICY FACTORS IN ENFORCING THE CONSTITUTION

[A] In General

[B] Separation of Powers

[C] Federalism

[D] Protecting Individual Rights

Chapter 5 LEGALITY

§ 5.01 PRINCIPLE OF LEGALITY

[A] “Legality”: Definition

[B] Rationale

[C] Constitutional Law

[1] Bill of Attainder and *Ex Post Facto* Clauses

[2] Due Process Clause

§ 5.02 STATUTORY CLARITY

§ 5.03 AVOIDING UNDUE DISCRETION IN LAW ENFORCEMENT

§ 5.04 STRICT CONSTRUCTION OF STATUTES (RULE OF LENITY)

Chapter 6 PROPORTIONALITY

§ 6.01 “PROPORTIONALITY” IN THE CRIMINAL LAW: OVERVIEW

§ 6.02 UTILITARIANISM AND PROPORTIONALITY

[\[A\] General Principles](#)

[\[B\] Application of the Principles](#)

[\[1\] General Deterrence](#)

[\[2\] Individual Deterrence or Incapacitation](#)

[\[3\] Rehabilitation](#)

[xiii/xiv]

[§ 6.03 RETRIBUTIVISM AND PROPORTIONALITY](#)

[\[A\] General Principles](#)

[\[B\] Application of the Principles](#)

[\[1\] In General](#)

[\[2\] Devising a Proportional Retributive System](#)

[§ 6.04 COMPARING THE TWO THEORIES OF PROPORTIONALITY](#)

[§ 6.05 CONSTITUTIONAL REQUIREMENT OF PROPORTIONALITY](#)

[\[A\] General Principles](#)

[\[B\] Death Penalty](#)

[\[C\] Terms of Imprisonment](#)

[\[1\] *Rummel v. Estelle*](#)

[\[2\] *Solem v. Helm*](#)

[\[3\] *Harmelin v. Michigan*](#)

[\[4\] *Ewing v. California*](#)

[\[5\] Summary](#)

[Chapter 7 BURDENS OF PROOF](#)

[§ 7.01 PUTTING THE ISSUES IN PROCEDURAL CONTEXT](#)

[§ 7.02 BURDEN OF PRODUCTION](#)

[\[A\] Nature of the Burden](#)

[\[B\] Who Has the Burden?](#)

[\[C\] How Great Is the Burden?](#)

[\[D\] Effect of Failing to Meet the Burden](#)

[§ 7.03 BURDEN OF PERSUASION](#)

[\[A\] Nature of the Burden](#)

[\[B\] Who Has the Burden?](#)

[\[1\] The Presumption of Innocence: The *Winship* Doctrine \(In General\)](#)

[\[2\] *Mullaney v. Wilbur*](#)

[\[3\] *Patterson v. New York*](#)

[\[4\] Post-*Patterson* Case Law](#)

[\[a\] In General](#)

[\[b\] Element of an Offense versus a Defense](#)

[\[C\] How Great Is the Burden?](#)

[\[1\] Elements of Crimes: Proof Beyond a Reasonable Doubt](#)

[\[2\] Defenses](#)

[\[D\] Effect of Failing to Meet the Burden](#)

[\[1\] Elements of Crimes](#)

[\[2\] Defenses](#)

[§ 7.04 MODEL PENAL CODE](#)

[xiv/xv]

[Chapter 8 PRESUMPTIONS](#)

[§ 8.01 THE NATURE OF A PRESUMPTION](#)

[§ 8.02 MANDATORY PRESUMPTIONS](#)

[\[A\] Rebuttable Presumptions](#)

[\[B\] Irrebuttable \(“Conclusive”\) Presumptions](#)

[§ 8.03 PERMISSIVE PRESUMPTIONS \(“INFERENCES”\)](#)

[§ 8.04 MODEL PENAL CODE](#)

[Chapter 9 ACTUS REUS](#)

[§ 9.01 ACTUS REUS: GENERAL PRINCIPLES](#)

[\[A\] Definition](#)

[\[B\] Punishing Thoughts: Why Not?](#)

[§ 9.02 VOLUNTARY ACT: GENERAL PRINCIPLES](#)

[\[A\] General Rule](#)

[\[B\] The “Act”](#)

[\[C\] “Voluntary”](#)

[\[1\] Broad Meaning: In the Context of Defenses](#)

[\[2\] Narrow Meaning: In the Context of the *Actus Reus*](#)

[\[3\] “Voluntariness”: At the Edges](#)

[\[a\] Hypnotism](#)

[\[b\] Multiple Personality \(or Dissociative Identity\) Disorder](#)

[\[D\] Voluntary Act Requirement: Rationale](#)

[\[E\] Burden of Proof](#)

[\[F\] The Issue of “Time-Framing”](#)

[§ 9.03 VOLUNTARY ACT: SUPPOSED \(BUT NOT REAL\) EXCEPTIONS TO THE REQUIREMENT](#)

[\[A\] Poorly Drafted Statutes](#)

[\[B\] Status Offenses](#)

[\[C\] Crimes of Possession](#)

§ 9.04 VOLUNTARY ACT: CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

[\[A\] *Robinson v. California*](#)

[\[B\] *Powell v. Texas*](#)

[\[C\] Current Law: *Powell* in Light of *Robinson*](#)

§ 9.05 VOLUNTARY ACT: MODEL PENAL CODE

[\[A\] General Principles](#)

[\[B\] Exception to the Rule](#)

§ 9.06 OMISSIONS: GENERAL PRINCIPLES

[\[A\] General Rule](#)

[\[B\] Criticisms of the General Rule](#)

[\[C\] Defense of the General Rule](#)

§ 9.07 OMISSIONS: EXCEPTIONS TO THE NO-LIABILITY RULE

[xv/xvi]

[\[A\] Common Law Duty to Act: “Commission by Omission”](#)

[\[1\] Overview](#)

[\[2\] When There Is a Duty to Act](#)

[\[a\] Status Relationship](#)

[\[b\] Contractual Obligation](#)

[\[c\] Omissions Following an Act](#)

[\[i\] Creation of a Risk](#)

[\[ii\] Voluntary Assistance](#)

[\[B\] Statutory Duty \(Including “Bad Samaritan” Laws\)](#)

§ 9.08 OMISSIONS: MODEL PENAL CODE

§ 9.09 MEDICAL “OMISSIONS”: A SPECIAL PROBLEM

[\[A\] Act or Omission?](#)

- **[download online The Art of Argument: A Guide to Mooting \(Law in Context S.\)](#)**
- [read La Vie heureuse ; La Brievet  de la vie pdf, azw \(kindle\), epub](#)
- [click The Naturally Clean Home: 150 Super-Easy Herbal Formulas for Green Cleaning](#)
- [A Funny Thing About Love online](#)
- [download Booze Cakes: Confections Spiked with Spirits, Wine and Beer online](#)

- <http://anvilpr.com/library/The-Swarm--A-Novel-of-the-Deep.pdf>
- <http://xn--d1aboelcb1f.xn--p1ai/lib/La-Vie-heureuse---La-Bri--vet---de-la-vie.pdf>
- <http://aseasonedman.com/ebooks/I-m-Sorry-You-Feel-That-Way--The-Astonishing-But-True-Story-of-a-Daughter--Sister--Slut--Wife--Mother--and-Frien>
- <http://www.1973vision.com/?library/A-Funny-Thing-About-Love.pdf>
- <http://schroff.de/books/Dracula--Oxford-World-s-Classics-.pdf>